

Stanley Brandes
University of California, Berkeley

Review of *Tenatsali* ou l'ethnologue qui fut transformé en indien, by Frank Hamilton Cushing (eds. Frédéric Saumade and Patrick Pérez)

This important monograph comes to me as a revelation. When I think back to my years as a graduate student in the 1960s, I remember hearing nothing about Frank Cushing except that he went native. Most of us never read his extensive publications, and his lengthy residence among the Zuni was reduced in our minds to a cautionary tale regarding fieldwork: be sure to maintain an objective distance from your research subjects. For five years starting in 1879, Frank Hamilton Cushing resided among the Zuni. He adopted the Zuni name Tenatsali and, enduring difficult initiation rites, became a member of the sacred society of the Bow. He strove to become a Zuni, and largely succeeded in that goal. This experience, according to our academic training, represented a serious breach of the scientific objectivity that fieldworkers were supposed to maintain. When Cushing departed Zuni, his public appearances in native garb and seemingly outlandish photographic displays made him famous. It was these performative acts, rather than his ethnographic writing, that became his most memorable legacy, a legacy disdained and derided by professional anthropologists. For us graduate students, Cushing was a kind of anti-hero.

Following Cushing's work, there emerged a wealth of accumulated anthropological knowledge about Zuni. Trilokey Nath Pandey's classic article «Anthropologists at Zuni» (1972) chronicles the works of nearly two dozen anthropologists, including some of the most influential in our discipline, who have lived among and written about Zuni. It is significant, however, that at least for one native Zuni, Cushing holds a special place among these scholars. Almost a century after Cushing's lived at Zuni, indigenous artist Phil Hughte published *A*

Zuni Artist Looks at Frank Hamilton Cushing (1994). This book, an illuminating and sometimes amusing collection of cartoons about Cushing's experiences among his people, reinforces the colorful aura that has long dominated images of Cushing. It was Cushing, not the others, whom Hughte chose to target.

Among anthropologists and educated people throughout the world today, Zuni pueblo is among the most celebrated ethnographic sites. Its fame derives from Ruth Benedict's best-selling monograph, *Patterns of Culture* (1934). There she contrasts Zuni religious rituals, political behavior, and world view, with those of two other peoples, the Melanesian Dobu and the Northwest Coast Kwakiutl, both cast in much less favorable light than the Zuni among whom she had carried out fieldwork. Based largely on Benedict's observations at Zuni, this book paints a portrait of the pueblo as what she termed «Apollonian»--harmonious, conflict-free and nearly idyllic. Numerous scholars have challenged this view. The rich ethnographic and analytical material contained in *Tenatsali* at least partially support Ruth Benedict's critics. Cushing's personal struggles to become accepted among the Zuni, as conveyed in several chapters from this book, also defy Benedict's idyllic portrait. (During my own brief visit to Zuni in 2014, I thought back to Benedict's descriptions, which were at odds with warnings I received from Zuni men who told me not to walk around at night, when I might encounter trouble from adolescent boys.)

Tenatsali ou l'ethnologue qui fut transformé en Indien is for multiple reasons a wonderful and welcome publication. This book contributes significantly to anthropological knowledge in at least two ways: first to a scholarly and balanced biography of Frank Hamilton Cushing as ethnologist; and second to detailed sociocultural information about Zuni in the late nineteenth century. The heart of *Tenatsali* consists of some twenty-five wide-ranging essays by Cushing, all of which provide a solid historical and descriptive examination of Zuni society and culture. These essays, mainly published in specialized journals during the 1880s and 1890s, are beautifully translated into French by Éléonore Devevey. They represent a broad range of subject matter, starting with Cushing's memoirs of his frequently difficult experiences as a white man living among the Zuni, continuing with accounts of Zuni social and religious beliefs and practices, and ending with technical and aesthetic considerations of Zuni material culture, principally of arrows, copper, and pottery.

It will come as a surprise to many readers that Cushing, writing a full generation prior to publication of Bronislaw Malinowski's famous first chapter in *Argonauts of the Western Pacific* (1922), advocated for long-term residence among research subjects as a means to perceive the world through native eyes and learn their beliefs and behavior. Endowed with no formal anthropological training and working in an era when ethnographic knowledge came mainly through travelogues and missionary accounts, Cushing nonetheless pioneered in the formulation of fieldwork guidelines. The detailed cultural information and methodological analysis in Cushing's essays provide a highly readable and illuminating introduction into the history of American

anthropology and the ethnography of the indigenous peoples of the United States southwest.

The two editors of this volume, Patrick Pérez and Frédéric Saumade, deserve high praise not only for selecting and compiling the Cushing essays that form the bulk of this book, but also for contributing insightful commentaries that precede each one of them. Both editors also provide invaluable introductory and concluding essays of their own. Saumade's contributions place Cushing's writing at the forefront of many of the anthropological paradigms and theories that emerged long afterward Cushing's untimely death at the age of 42. Saumade convincingly demonstrates Cushing's reflexive perspective, his awareness of his own sensitive position within Zuni society as an intermediary between the indigenous host society and the richer, more powerful white readership towards whom his work was directed. In Saumade's analysis, too, Cushing's analyses foreshadows the much better known theories of Robert Hertz, Lévy-Bruhl, Claude Lévi-Strauss, and other eminent figures in our discipline. Saumade's reading of Cushing emphasizes Cushing as theoretician. He effectively undermines prevailing views of Cushing's scholarship as trivial, and raises Cushing's public profile to that of innovative scholar. Patrick Pérez, a specialist in the Hopi tribe and Native American architecture, contributes an important chapter concerning Zuni history, its changing relationship to white society, and its place among other New Mexico indigenous pueblos. Both authors demonstrate a detailed, intimate knowledge of American history, Native American ethnography, and anthropological theory. Their breadth and depth of knowledge, erudition, and scholarly rigor are impressive. It is to them we owe the appearance of this invaluable volume.

Tenatsali is essential reading not only for French social scientists who are interested in American anthropology, but also for Americans interested in their own ethnic diversity and disciplinary history. It is an intelligently organized, beautifully written, and intellectually valuable contribution to anthropological literature.

References Cited

- Ruth Benedict, *Patterns of Culture* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1934).
Hughte, Phil, *A Zuni Artist Looks at Frank Hamilton Cushing* (A:shivi A:wam Museum and Heritage Center, 1994)
Malinowski, Bronislaw, *Argonauts of the Western Pacific* (New York: Dutton, 1922)
Saumade, Frédéric & Pérez, Patrick (Eds.), *Frank Hamilton Cushing. Tenatsali ou l'ethnologue qui fut transformé en indien* (Paris: CNRS Editions, 2022).